

The Board of Elections in the City of New York

**Long-Term Voting System
Evaluation Team Report**

Distributed to Commissioners

March 17, 2009

Revised December 22, 2009

Final Version

Introduction

This is the revised Evaluation Team Report for the Long-Term Voting System for the Board of Elections in the City of New York (BOE in NYC) initially prepared in March 2009. This revised report addresses two issues:

- Changes to the voting systems made during the New York State Board of Elections (NYSBOE) certification process.
- An option that combines one vendor's ballot scanner with another vendor's Ballot Marking Device (BMD)

The March 17th report was prepared prior to completion of the NYSBOE certification process.

The Evaluation Team reconvened in December of 2009 to review the lists of vendor provided changes to their systems that were required by the certification process. The Evaluation Team membership remained consistent except for one member who was unable to participate.

Changes Resulting from State Certification

After reviewing the changes submitted by the vendors, the Team identified evaluation categories that were potentially affected by the changes. Affected categories were:

1.2 Pollsite Voting System Functionality

1.3 EMS Functionality

2.1 EMS & Pollsite Voting System Maintenance

2.2. Pre-Election Set-up

2.3 Post-Election Activities and Testing

3.1 Pollworker Activities

3.2 Voter Activity – Voting Process

3.3 Voter Activity – Voter Assistance Devices

4.1 Security Strategy and Physical Security

4.2 Software Security

The Team rescored these categories based solely on the changes that were received from the vendors. The revised results are included at the end of this document.

Option to Combine Devices from Both Certified Systems

The proposed option is to combine the Dominion ImageCast Scanner with the ES&S AutoMark. A ballot produced by the Dominion Election Management System (EMS) with data from the ES&S EMS can be marked by the ES&S AutoMark and scanned and tallied by the Dominion ImageCast Scanner. The Evaluation Team did not evaluate the proposed combination.

Three systems were certified by the NYSBOE at their December 15th meeting:

- (1) ES&S AutoMark and its EMS (Unity Suite/ElectionWare)
- (2) ES&S Scanner and its EMS (Unity Suite/ElectionWare)
- (3) Dominion Scanner and its EMS (Democracy Suite)

There is no mention of any combination of these three systems in the certification resolutions. The Team evaluated the following combinations:

- ES&S DS 200 Scanner, ES&S AutoMark BMD, and Unity Suite/ElectionWare EMS
- Dominion ImageCast Scanner, Dominion ImageCast Scanner and BMD combination, and Dominion Democracy Suite EMS.

Evaluation Team Members

Barbara Conacchio, Marianne Effinger, Steven Ferguson, Lucille Grimaldi, Troy Johnson, John Naudus, John O'Grady, Rosanna Rahmouni

Executive Review Team

Marcus Cederqvist, George Gonzalez, Pamela Perkins, Steven Richman

Updated Selection Timeline

For this evaluation, the following timeline was used:

Task		Start Date	End Date
Phase I	Submit RFI to Vendor Community		
1	Issue Request for Information (RFI)	Dec 17, 2008	Dec 17, 2008
2	Vendor's Develop and Submit Responses	Dec 20, 2008	Jan 20, 2009
Phase II	Vendor Selection		
1	Post all responses received (all parts) to the RFI on the BOE Website (after review for security details and subsequent redaction).	Feb 23, 2009	Feb 23, 2009
2	Gartner Compiles Vendor Responses	Jan 21, 2009	Jan 27, 2009
3	BOE Evaluation Team Reviews Responses	Feb 02, 2009	Mar 04, 2009
4	Evaluation Team Meetings	Feb 18, 2009	Mar 16, 2009
5	Gartner Independently Prepares Cost Analysis Report, Voting System Assessment Report and the Security Assessment Report	Jan 27, 2009	Mar 13, 2009
6	Public Demonstration before Commissioners	Feb 10, 2009	Feb 10, 2009
7	Conduct Hearing for Public Comment on Voting Systems	Mar 04, 2009	Mar 04, 2009
8	Conduct Vendor Interviews	Feb 18, 2009	Feb 18, 2009
9	Vendor Step Throughs	Mar 05, 2009	Mar 06, 2009
10	Conduct Scoring of Vendor Responses	Mar 09, 2009	Mar 13, 2009
11	Prepare report (Gartner and BOE staff) providing Evaluation Team ratings and submit to BOE Executive Management.	Mar 13, 2009	Mar 16, 2009
12	Submit Reports to Commissioners	Mar 17, 2009	Mar 17, 2009
13	NYS BOE Certification	Dec 15, 2009	Dec 15, 2009
14	Public Demonstrations in each Borough	Dec 16, 2009	Dec 22, 2009
15	Prepare Revised Report (Gartner and BOE staff) providing revised Evaluation Team ratings based on vendor changes and submit to BOE Executive Management.	Dec 17, 2009	Dec 23, 2009
16	Submit Revised Report to Commissioners	Dec 23, 2009	Dec 23, 2009
17	Reports posted on BOE website and made available on the BOE front counter at 32 Broadway	Dec 28, 2009	Dec 28, 2009
18	Conduct Hearing for Public Comment on Voting Systems	Dec 29, 2009	Dec 29, 2009
19	Board of Commissioners Vote on Voting System Vendor Selection (includes presentation of reports and public comments at the start of the meeting)	Jan 5, 2010	Jan 5, 2010
20	Develop Detailed Requisition of Vendor Equipment and Services	Jan 12, 2010	Jan 31, 2010

Revised Results

The revised results are as follows by category for each vendor: A perfect score would be 4,995 points.

Evaluation Category	Sub-Sec. Weight	Overall Weight	ES&S Score	Dominion Score
1) Voting System Design				
1.1) Pollsite Voting System Mechanical Characteristics	10.0%	1.7%	60	53
1.2) Pollsite Voting System Functionality	40.0%	6.8%	264	249
1.3) EMS Functionality	10.0%	1.7%	62	62
1.4) EMS Server Environment	10.0%	1.7%	51	55
1.5) Ballot Display	10.0%	1.7%	53	62
1.6) EMS Specifications	10.0%	1.7%	53	57
1.7) Pollsite Voting System Specifications	10.0%	1.7%	59	59
TOTAL	100%	17%	602	597
2) Board Operations	Sub-Sec. Weight	Overall Weight	ES&S	Dominion
2.1) EMS & Pollsite Voting System Maintenance	33.3%	4.3%	148	148
2.2) Pre-Election Set-up	33.3%	4.3%	148	162
2.3) Post-Election Activities - and Testing	33.3%	4.3%	153	153
TOTAL	100%	13%	449	463
3) Election Day Operations	Sub-Sec. Weight	Overall Weight	ES&S	Dominion
3.1) Pollworker Activity	10.2%	1.7%	68	64
3.2) Voter Activity - Voting Process	49.1%	8.2%	301	301
3.3) Voter Activity - Voter Assistance Devices	30.5%	5.1%	204	170
3.4) Technician Activity	10.2%	1.7%	60	51
TOTAL	100%	17%	633	586
4) Security & Privacy	Sub-Sec. Weight	Overall Weight	ES&S	Dominion
4.1) Security Strategy and Physical Security	30.0%	5.10%	170	147
4.2) Software Security	30.0%	5.10%	170	159
4.3) Voter Privacy	40.0%	6.80%	219	249
TOTAL	100%	17%	559	555
5) Implementation Services	Sub-Sec. Weight	Overall Weight	ES&S	Dominion
5.1) Interfaces	14.3%	1.90%	57	65
5.2) Receipt & Acceptance Testing	14.3%	1.90%	59	59
5.3) Staff Training	14.3%	1.90%	63	63
5.4) Pollworker Training	14.3%	1.90%	65	61
5.5) First-Time Support	14.3%	1.90%	61	68
5.6) One-time Other Services	14.3%	1.90%	61	68
5.7) Public Education Assistance	14.3%	1.90%	65	61
TOTAL	100%	13%	431	445

6) On-Going Support	Sub-Sec. Weight	Overall Weight	ES&S	Dominion
6.1) Warranty Services	20.0%	2.20%	73	76
6.2) Staff Training	20.0%	2.20%	76	78
6.3) Pollworker Training	20.0%	2.20%	71	73
6.4) On-going Support Services	20.0%	2.20%	66	86
6.5) Testing	20.0%	2.20%	68	68
TOTAL	100%	11%	354	381
7) Vendor Strength & Experience	Sub-Sec. Weight	Overall Weight	ES&S	Dominion
7.1) Certification (2002 - 2005)	20.0%	2.40%	77	69
7.2) Reference Jurisdictions	20.0%	2.40%	72	64
7.3) Election Experience	20.0%	2.40%	88	83
7.4) Litigation	20.0%	2.40%	72	75
7.5) Manufacturing & Delivery Capacity	20.0%	2.40%	80	77
TOTAL	100%	12%	389	368
GRAND TOTAL			3417	3395

Revised Final Scores – The revised composite team score of each voting system across all of the categories and sub-categories (See Evaluation Criteria and Criteria Weightings) is:

- a) ES&S – 3,417
- b) Dominion – 3,395

Respectfully submitted by the Board of Elections in the City of New York Voting System Evaluation Team.